Summary Skills and Learner Achievement in Reading Comprehension in Nairobi, Kenya: Prospects, Constraints and Policy

Elizabeth Asewe Oluoch*, Paul Amollo Odundo, Ruth Mugo Kahiga

Department of Educational Communication, Technology and Pedagogical Studies, University of Nairobi, Nairobi, Kenya

Email address:
aseweelizabeth@gmail.com (Elizabeth Asewe Oluoch), odundopaul@yahoo.com (Paul Amollo Odundo), ruth.wangu@uonbi.ac.ke (Ruth Mugo Kahiga)
*Corresponding author

To cite this article:

Received: August 23, 2023; Accepted: September 11, 2023; Published: September 20, 2023

Abstract: Summary skills support acquisition of reading capabilities by strengthening knowledge of text through identification of critical ideas, creation of concise notes and restatement of concepts for sustainable comprehension competencies. In instances where the technique is inadequately developed, capacity of the learner to sift through content in text to identify themes, filter own words and integrate messages may be compromised. The study examined effect of summary skills in acquisition of reading for learner achievement in comprehension. The targeted eight schools arrived at a sample of 476 using purposive, simple random sampling, principles of Solomon Four Group design and census model. Quasi-experimental design based on Solomon Four Group Design was used yielding 223 learners assigned to experimental while 253 control groups and 8 teachers of English. Reading comprehension tests, questionnaires, in-class observation and follow up discussion sessions were used in capturing data. Learners in experimental group obtained post-test mean of 33.47 (SD=15.55); control group obtained mean of 26.82 (SD=12.76), indicating that experimental scored highly in post-test than control group, not exposed to task-based learning method. The analysis obtained t-statistic of 3.24 (df=428, p=0.001), suggesting up to 99% chance that mean obtained by learners in experimental and control groups were significantly different. In addition, variable school was significantly associated with learning outcomes in comprehending text (p<0.000). Analysis revealed up to 95% chance that learner achievement in reading comprehension significantly associated with restating ideas in own words (X² =20.823, df=9, p-value=0.013). Furthermore, results indicated that main concept displayed significant and positive association with learner achievement in reading comprehension in experimental and control groups at 95% CI and 90% CI respectively; (Model 1: Beta = 2.223, t = 2.120; Model 2: Beta = 1.673 t = 1.754. The study suggested that teachers be enlightened about the need of adopting multiple techniques to assist the learner to develop summary abilities in order to heighten greater levels of understanding and better grades.

Keywords: Main Idea, Making Notes, Reading Skills, Restating Ideas, Summary Skills

1. Introduction

Task-based learning anchored on acquisition of reading skills but based on summary capabilities focusing on main concepts, making concise notes enhanced understanding of text for higher comprehension scores for sustained learning. According to Ozdemir [16] summarizing improves knowledge and memory for instructive effectiveness. Expanding on this view, Qomariyah [18] claimed that recognition of critical content during summary maximizes recollection and retention of idea to accentuate mastery of concepts for accelerated learning. Arguably, summarizing enhances creativity by providing opportunities for use of own words stimulating a desire to read material better [14] for effective learning. However, improper preparation of summary abilities denies the learner opportunity to
comprehend material for quick note taking and identification of themes weakening learning of words and phrases reducing accomplishments. According to Anyienda, Odundo and Kibui [1] summarizing capabilities increased learner achievement in reading comprehension with the impact being noticeably greater in experimental group than in control group. The findings further revealed that summary skills significantly influenced learner achievement in reading comprehension. Maybodi and Maibodi [12] in a study on teaching summarization strategies on reading comprehension of Science and Humanities among Iranian high school learners concluded that learner exposure to summarizing strategies increases awareness of processes to be applied for better understanding of passage content for improved comprehension abilities.

Reading with intention of summarizing requires deliberate active operations targeted at extracting essence of a text enshrined in language in education policy in Kenya [15] for better attainment in comprehension. Moreover, according to Grabe [4] employing a range of comprehension abilities, from word recognition to strategic thinking, summarizing promotes increased levels of text processing for improved mastery of comprehension passages. Marzec-Stawiar ska [11] noticed that learner extensive text processing during summarization may likely result in internalization of ideas for greater accomplishment. Writing recaps enable the learner to develop connections between concepts and past knowledge heightening mastery of passage content for better scores. Learners require summary abilities such as identifying key concept idea, making brief notes and restating ideas for improving mastery of comprehension passages for effective learning.

1.1. Statement of the Problem

Task-based learning centred on the development of reading skills based on summary abilities with unique learner characteristics influenced by reasonable teacher workload may most likely boost achievement in reading comprehension. However, in situations where task-based learning in not predicated on the growth of reading competence based on summary skills with learner proficiency influenced by depressing teacher workload attainment in reading comprehension may be lowered. More still, properly designed main idea strategy tends to actively involve the learner in monitoring understanding while simultaneously identifying essential points by omitting unimportant details and integrating primary concepts across paragraphs strengthening comprehension of text for effective learning. In situations when a learner’s capability to sift through primary concepts presented in comprehension passages is constrained, ability to draw connections between textual ideas is diminished lowering accomplishment. Additionally, making notes motivates the learner to focus on key elements of a text read or listened to deepening knowledge of subject matter for long-term learning.

Unfortunately, in instances where the learner tends to note every word read or listened to ability to synthesize knowledge may suffer making it more difficult to analyse new material jeopardizing comprehension of text. Moreover, restating ideas may enhance recall of core insights while encouraging creativity through use of own words and maintaining main concepts from original source boosting understanding for effective learning. However, identification of significant themes and writing ideas in own words may be impaired if the learner has limited lexical and grammatical skills which would lower achievement in reading comprehension, where the learner has limited lexical and grammatical knowledge identification of main points and writing in own words may be weakened reducing attainment in reading comprehension. Adopting summary skills during reading process through main idea strategy for topic sentence, making brief notes to capture essential information and restating ideas for use of appropriate words may assist primary school learners to internalize concepts for higher achievement. The study sought to establish effect of summarization in acquisition of reading skills on learner achievement in comprehension in primary schools within Nairobi City County, Kenya.

1.2. Purpose and Objectives of the Study

The purpose of this study was to examine effect of summary skills on learner achievement in reading comprehension in public primary schools in Nairobi City County, Kenya. Objectives were to:

1) Examine effect of anticipation guide on achievement in reading comprehension.
2) Establish effect of making notes on learner achievement in reading comprehension.
3) Assess effect of restating ideas on learner achievement in reading comprehension.

2. Literature

Effective learning of summary competencies stimulates recognition of related themes which reinforces key concepts by making concise notes expressed in own words for improved mastery of reading materials. In instances where ability to summarize using correct sentences is impeded, text construction may be degraded limiting learner capacity to understand passages.

2.1. Main Concept and Attainment in Reading Comprehension

Task-based learning anchored on gaining of reading abilities built on summary skills but focusing on recognizing primary concepts alongside learner uniqueness requires locating essential messages within a particular portion or paragraph of the material for better scores in reading comprehension. According to Kulo, Odundo and Kibui [10], understanding main proposition in a text is an essential part of adapting readers’ theatre approach in mastering passage content for effective learning. However, in instances where
2.2. Restating Ideas and Accomplishment in Comprehending Text

Making notes is a process that consists of writing down key words and concepts from original source to solidify understanding for higher scores. According to Ozcakmak [17] note taking draws attention to material read or listened by raising attainment in comprehension. Rahmani and Sadeghi [19] expanded on this view by stating that note taking enhances learning of both oral and written materials for improved mastery of concepts. This suggests that note taking helps with integration of language abilities by enhancing articulation of words through listening, reading and writing for better scores. However, when note taking method is improperly constructed, attention to important points may be hampered by lowering capability to actualize comprehension for learning. Ozcakmak [17] explored Turkish language prospective teachers’ accomplishments in comprehension employing causal comparative research model at the Department of Turkish Language Teaching at Education Faculty of Hatay Mustafa Kemal University while the present study focused on public primary schools in the confines of Nairobi City County, Kenya. More still, according to Kamau, Oundo and Inyega [6] adaptation of round robin technique encourages integration of ideas through writing by sharing values in groups which transforms to critical thinking abilities and active engagement for improved attainment. Making notes while reading actively engages the learner to identify main points and organise ideas for improved learning results. Moreover, Kiewra and Fletcher [8] noted that in situations where obstacles exist, the learner may require more support in using note taking strategy for effective learning.

2.3. Restating Ideas and Achievement in Reading Comprehension

Restating ideas strategy is the practice of rewriting or retelling key concepts using own words to enhance understanding for effective learning. According to Tran and Nguyen [24] extracting primary concepts from text while maintaining essential meanings of the source enhances understanding for higher scores. Kissner [9] asserted that restating ideas fosters creativity and active participation improving internalization of the subject matter for efficient learning. Hidayati [5] acknowledged that paraphrasing focuses on reading the paragraph and asking questions on main ideas and supplementary details in own words for better grasp of concepts. Additionally, according to Regala-Flores and Lopez [21], mastery of English language increases capacity for paraphrasing to better comprehend comprehension passages. A study conducted by Ahn [2] on summary writing abilities of Korean University learners mentioned paraphrasing strategy as one of the most effective strategies for experimental group by pinpointing ability to use own words using synonyms and changing the structure of sentences summary writing abilities in a one-time a week for 100 minutes in a 15 week semester However, in instances where paraphrasing procedures are inappropriately structured putting ideas in own words may be undermined hindering capacity to comprehend material reducing reading comprehension accomplishment. Moreover, learners with inadequate lexical and grammatical skills are more inclined to replicate sentences from original text impairing ability to write effectively lowering attainment. Mentari [13] argued that when picking appropriate words to employ for paraphrasing is challenging, retaining meaning of original material is reduced by lowering learner capability to actualize understanding of text.

2.4. Theoretical Frame

The study was anchored on social constructivist theory [25] emphasizing on social interaction, more knowledgeable other (MKO) and zone of proximal development (ZPD). The study is further supported by interactive reading model that embraces the idea that neither the bottom-up nor the top-down explanations of reading are sufficient to adequately describe the reading process in isolation. According to Rumelhart [22], the reading process is a simultaneous joint application to all sources of knowledge. Social constructivist theory stresses the value of social interaction in learning which involves discussions, exchanging perspectives and co-constructing texts to increase understanding for sustained learning. Social constructivist theory is put in practise through teaching methods emphasizing group work, class interaction, active participation and integration of abilities to improve reading proficiency for long-term learning. Involvement of the teacher and peers in task-based learning in the capacity of more knowledgeable other tends to boost task completion which may likely build mastery of material for improved achievement in comprehension passages.
Interaction with others enables the learner to move past zone of proximal development [23] and achieve higher levels of textual comprehension. The support provided by a more knowledgeable individual such as a teacher or a peer enables the learner to bridge the gap between current understanding and potential level of development within ZPD by gradually reducing reliance on outside help while gaining more mastery of texts for better learning. Additionally, improved comprehension of passages requires a mix of bottom-up and top-down processes that integrate text analysis with arousal of past knowledge for effective learning. Interactive reading theory emphasizes active engagement by monitoring understanding, evaluating usefulness of information and making informed judgements about what to include or leave out of summaries enhancing mastery of content for better learning.

2.5. Conceptual Framework

The conceptual framework in Figure 1 displays connection between competency is summarizing and attainment in reading comprehension.

The study conceptualized a relationship between summary skills and learner achievement in reading comprehension. Summary ability is realized when the learner engages in main idea strategy, making brief notes and restating ideas influenced by learner characteristics and teacher workload for accelerated learning.

3. Methodology

The study adopted Solomon Four non-equivalent-Group Design to guide the process premised on positivist and constructivist paradigms. Based on the schools of thought, both quantitative and qualitative methods were applied to capture primary data on summary skills capabilities while engaged with comprehension passages. The study targeted standard 7 learners and teachers of English within Nairobi City County, Kenya. Choice of standard 7 was influenced by the fact that learners had adequate exposure language to take part in meaningful interaction during task-based learning. Purposive sampling, simple random sampling, census and principles of Solomon Four Group Design were used to determine the sample size. Four educational divisions were involved based on simple random sampling. From each educational division, 2 schools were purposively selected based on socio economic factors. The process yielded 8 schools with one teacher of English language from each school selected purposively. More still, 476 learners and 8 teachers participated in the study.

Drawing from the design’s principles, eight public primary schools were randomly assigned to four groups: experimental group which received both pre- and post-intervention, experimental group that receives post-test only, control group which received pre- and post-intervention and control group with post-test only. The four groups were subjected to post-test after treatment period. The experimental group included schools code named A, B, C and D, (n=223), while control group consisted of schools E, F, G and H, (n=253). Teachers of English in the experimental group were trained on application of task-based learning while control group were not. Again, learners in schools B and C in experimental group and schools F and G in control group were exposed to pre-test. After observation, learners in the eight schools were subjected to post-test.

Data collection tools were designed, developed, piloted and verified before actual data collection. The pilot study was conducted between July and September, 2021 and necessary adjustments were incorporated. The instruments included a set of questionnaires for learners and for teachers of English, class observation, reading comprehension achievement test (Pre- and post-test) and follow up discussion sessions. Data
collection was triangulated to strengthen validity and reliability. In this study, data triangulation included administering questionnaires to teachers and learners and class observations and follow up discussion sessions to corroborate questionnaire data.

Data from lesson observations and follow up discussion sessions were analysed qualitatively through thematic interpretations from discussions in emerging areas guided by study objectives. Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 26 was used to analyse quantitative data. Quantitative data included cross-tabulations, independent samples t-tests used to determine statistical significance of variations in mean scores obtained by learners in experimental and control groups; as well as mean scores obtained by learners subjected to pre-test and those not pretested. In addition, Chi Square ($\chi^2$) statistic was applied to collection was triangulated to strengthen validity and reliability. In this study, data triangulation included administering questionnaires to teachers and learners and class observations and follow up discussion sessions to corroborate questionnaire data.

Data from lesson observations and follow up discussion sessions were analysed qualitatively through thematic interpretations from discussions in emerging areas guided by study objectives. Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 26 was used to analyse quantitative data. Quantitative data included cross-tabulations, independent samples t-tests used to determine statistical significance of variations in mean scores obtained by learners in experimental and control groups; as well as mean scores obtained by learners subjected to pre-test and those not pretested. In addition, Chi Square ($\chi^2$) statistic was applied to determine significance of the association between learner achievement in reading comprehension (post-test scores) and summary skills in acquisition of reading capabilities. Regression model was used to examine the impact of summary skills on learner attainment in reading comprehension. Interaction with study participants provided chances for queries, procedural clarifications and assurance of confidentiality.

4. Findings

4.1. Post-Test Scores Between Learners in Experimental and Control Groups

Results showed that summary skills positively influenced achievement in reading comprehension. This was measured through a post-intervention test, hereinafter referred to as “post-test”, which measured participants’ reading comprehension displayed in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. Variation in post-test scores between learners in experimental and control groups.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Post-test</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>N</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mean</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Std. Deviation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Std. Error Mean</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>95% CI Lower</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>95% CI Upper</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results presented in Table 1 indicated that learners in experimental group obtained post-test mean of 33.47 (SD=15.55); while those in control group obtained a mean score of 26.82 (SD=12.76), indicating the experimental group managed to score highly in the post-test than the control groups, who were not exposed to the task based learning methods. This implies that task-based learning had a considerable impact on experimental group. The analysis obtained t-statistic of 3.24 (df=428, p=0.001), which suggested up to 99% chance that mean obtained by learners in experimental and control groups were significantly different implying that task-based learning clearly had a substantial impact on increasing comprehension of text. More still, mean obtained by learners in experimental group (33.47) was higher than in control group (29.21). The findings revealed that training of teachers on correct application of task-based learning was successful in raising student progress in understanding passage content and in teaching summary abilities. The study results concur with Anyienda, Odundo and Kibui [1] who noted that educating teachers of English language on proper techniques for triggering learner summary abilities may likely provide value by improving efficiency of lesson delivery.

4.2. Bivariate Analysis of Summary Skills Attitude and Achievement in Comprehension

Learners were required to indicate opinions about three aspects of summary skills framed as perception statements on a four-point rating scale, calibrated as ‘strongly agree’, ‘agree’, ‘disagree’, and ‘strongly disagree’ as shown in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2. Summary Skills and learner attainment in comprehending texts.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summary Skills</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$$\chi^2 = 10.805 \; \text{df}=9; \; p=0.289$$
The results in Table 2 show that of 476 respondents, 216 (45.4%) approved, while 166 (34.9%) highly agreed with the strategy of pinpointing main ideas, whereas, 97 (19.7%) denied the claim. However, Chi-Square results indicated no connection between learner view on the statement and achievement in reading comprehension with a value of 10.805, \( df=9, p=0.289 \). Results from teachers’ questionnaires revealed that 7 (87.5%) supported the assertion “I read text to get the main idea of each paragraph” while 1 (12.5%) negated the claim. This was attributed to revelations by teachers that main idea strategy facilitated integration of themes across the reading material for improved attainment in reading comprehension. The results support Wulandari and Narmaditya [27] claim that using primary concept technique improves reading comprehension performance. The findings suggested that main idea instruction helped the learn identify ideas and draw logical links for better acceleration of comprehension abilities. Lessons observed revealed that the main idea strategy was implemented in experimental and control group. The result is consistent with Anyienda, Odundo and Kibui [1] observation that main concept methods was commonly used in experimental and control groups but noted that relying heavily on the strategy did not allow complete development of summary skills required for better comprehension scores.

Additionally, 323 (67.9%) admitted to making brief notes on important information, as compared to 153 (32.1%) completely disagreed with the strategy. However, Chi Square tests revealed no significant association between learner opinions on making brief notes on important information, \( \chi^2=13.565, \text{ df}=9, \text{ p-value}=0.139 \). According to survey results from teachers, 6 (75%) concurred with learner thoughts that making concise notes aided higher achievement in reading comprehension, while 2 (25%) opposed. Observed lessons showed that teachers did not actively encourage learners to take notes from written material. This was backed by confessions from teachers in a follow up discussion session that learners’ limited participation in taking quick notes to comprehend passages was caused by compromised reading abilities which decreased achievement in reading comprehension. Again, limited time due to teacher workload hindered use of innovative approaches in reading lessons. Similar to this, Ozcakmak (2019) observed that there were no significant differences in scores of learners engaged in note taking during reading and listening. However, Rahmani and Sadeghi [19] argued that experimental group that received training on how to take notes performed significantly better on comprehension and recall tests. Ideally, note taking assists learners in paying attention to important points and less attention to trivial details. Again, where the learner copies verbatim, attention to key concepts diminishes which may lower attainment.

Moreover, findings from learner questionnaires revealed that 275 (57.5%) acknowledged the assertion restating concepts in own words for better understanding, whereas 201 (42.2%) disapproved the proclamation. Chi square results revealed up to 95% chance that learner achievement in reading significantly associated with the sub dimension of restating ideas in own words \( \chi^2=20.823, \text{ df}=9, \text{ p-value}=0.013 \). Questionnaires for teachers revealed that 7 (87.5%) supported use of the strategy while 1 (12.5%) disagreed. Lessons observed showed that learners in experimental and control groups rarely utilized paraphrasing method in written assignment. However, learners from experimental group participated in oral restatement of concepts from comprehension passages read. Again, the teachers in experimental and control groups involved learners in reading the passages using silent reading and read aloud for better recall of key themes for effective learning. More still, reports from lessons observed showed that teachers assisted learners in experimental groups select words and maintain key themes while verbally restating concepts. Additionally, learners were excited about the assistance provided by teachers during interactions allowing activation of summary skills for sustained learning.

### 4.3. Multivariate Analysis of Summary Skills and Achievement in Comprehension

The study sought to ascertain effect of summary abilities as a component of acquisition of reading capabilities for accelerated scores. The independent variables included summary competencies comprising key concepts, making notes and restating themes, while the learner accomplishment informed the dependent variable. The moderating factors were learner characteristics including gender, school and sub-county as presented in Table 3.
The results presented in Table 3 show that in Model 1 and 2, main idea strategy caused a positive effect on learner achievement in reading comprehension at 95% CI and 90% CI respectively; (Model 1: Beta = 2.223, t = 2.120; Model 2: Beta = 1.673, t = 1.754). This indicates that using main concept technique generated a corresponding increase in reading comprehension. The findings of the study concur with Ozdemir [16] who declared that key concept strategy control group at 90% CI (Model 2: Beta = 2.223, t = 2.120; Model 2: Beta = 1.592, t = 1.937). In addition, the learner attributes variables such as school and sub county (Model 1: only: Beta = 5.240, t = 4.116) also showed positive and significant association with learner accomplishment in reading comprehension. School becomes crucial when infrastructure, human resources and traditional culture are considered as a determinant of choice by both parents and learners. Even though gender balance is critical in learner progress, the study established no the variable had no significant effect on ability to understand text.

### Table 3. Multivariate Analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Experimental</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>2.780</td>
<td>6.112</td>
<td>.455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Main ideas</td>
<td>2.223</td>
<td>1.048</td>
<td>.127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Making notes</td>
<td>.516</td>
<td>904</td>
<td>.034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Restating ideas</td>
<td>.237</td>
<td>.939</td>
<td>.015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School</td>
<td>6.164</td>
<td>.826</td>
<td>.440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sub county</td>
<td>5.240</td>
<td>1.273</td>
<td>.253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>-.248</td>
<td>1.746</td>
<td>-.083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Control</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>1.296</td>
<td>9.320</td>
<td>.139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Main ideas</td>
<td>1.673</td>
<td>.954</td>
<td>.117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Making notes</td>
<td>1.592</td>
<td>.898</td>
<td>.117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Restating ideas</td>
<td>.620</td>
<td>.831</td>
<td>.058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School</td>
<td>2.497</td>
<td>.908</td>
<td>.239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sub county</td>
<td>-.031</td>
<td>1.104</td>
<td>-.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>-.391</td>
<td>1.529</td>
<td>-.016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NB: *, **, *** show significance at p<0.1, p<0.05 and p<0.01 error margins, respectively.

### 6. Recommendations

1. Reorientation of innovations in teacher preparation programs for effective teaching of summary abilities.
2. Attending conferences, workshops and refresher training sessions may increase teacher effectiveness in conveying material for sustained learning. However, scarcity of resources to assist teacher preparation may make it more difficult to obtain ongoing professional development.
3. Enlighten teachers on the need for utilizing multiple strategies to assist the learner in building summary competencies.
4. Further research on interventions for summary skills.

### References


References


